Gettier on the JTB theory

The JTB theory is an attempt to give an analysis of the concept of knowledge. It tries to “break the concept down” by giving necessary and sufficient conditions for knowledge.

JTB:

A person Q knows that P if and only if:
1) Q believes that P
2) Q is justified in believing that P
3) P is true

Let’s first consider whether these are necessary conditions for knowledge.
Gettier on the JTB theory

A person Q knows that P if and only if:

1) Q believes that P
2) Q is justified in believing that P
3) P is true

First, let’s remove (1). Can we imagine a case in which I know something without believing it?
Gettier on the JTB theory

A person Q knows that P if and only if:

1) Q believes that P
2) Q is justified in believing that P
3) P is true

________________________

Next, let’s remove (2). Can I know something without being justified in believing it?
Gettier on the JTB theory

A person Q knows that P if and only if:

1) Q believes that P
2) Q is justified in believing that P
3) P is true

________________

Finally, let’s consider (3). Can I know something that isn’t true?

It looks like the conditions above may well be necessary to constitute knowledge. But are they sufficient? Gettier doesn’t think so, and he offers two examples to support his view.
Gettier on the JTB theory

CASE 1: Jones and the job interview.

Gettier claims that Smith has a belief that is true and justified. He does not think, however, that we will intuitively grant that Smith knows that “the man who will get the job has ten coins in his pocket.”

Intuition test 1: Does this case really satisfy the three JTB conditions?

Intuition test 2: Do we want to say that Smith knows that “the man who will get the job has ten coins in his pocket”?
Gettier on the JTB theory

CASE 2: Smith and the unidentified car

Gettier claims that Smith has a belief that is true and justified. He does not think, however, that we will intuitively grant that Smith knows that “either Jones owns a Ford, or Brown is in Barcelona”.

Intuition test 1: Does this case really satisfy the three JTB conditions?

Intuition test 2: Do we want to say that Smith knows that “either Jones owns a Ford, or Brown is in Barcelona”.