Antisemitism Definition, IHRA, Israel, Palestine References

<u>Section A -</u> Links Submitted to the DASG Senate and/or Office of College Life

- 1. Working Definition of Antisemitism | IHRA; <u>https://www.holocaustremembrance.com/resources/working-definitions-charters/working-definition-antisemitism</u>
- Defining Anti-Semitism US Department of State; <u>https://www.state.gov/defining-anti-semitism/</u>
- 3. FBI Hate Crime Statistics 2019; <u>https://ucr.fbi.gov/hate-crime/2019</u>
- 4. Hate Crime In CA 2019; <u>https://data-openjustice.doj.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2020-06/Hate%20Crime%20In%20CA%202019.pdf</u>
- IHRA definition of Antisemitism can foster healthy dialogues The Times of Israel; <u>https://blogs.timesofisrael.com/ihra-definition-of-antisemitism-canfoster-healthy-dialogues/</u>
- Anti-Semitism is a major problem on campuses, and students must be educated about it (opinion) – It's Time We Taught Anti-Semitism – Inside Higher Ed; <u>https://www.insidehighered.com/views/2021/02/02/anti-</u> <u>semitism-major-problem-campuses-and-students-must-be-educated-</u> <u>about-it-opinion</u>
- Combatting antisemitism: Why the world needs to adopt the IHRA definition – The Jerusalem Post; <u>https://www.jpost.com/opinion/combatting-antisemitism-why-the-world-needs-to-adopt-the-ihra-definition-645275</u>
- Freedom of speech and the Anti-Semitism Awareness Act on college campuses – The Hill; <u>https://thehill.com/blogs/congress-</u> <u>blog/politics/315195-freedom-of-speech-and-the-anti-semitism-awareness-</u> <u>act-on-college</u>
- 9. I drafted the definition of antisemitism. Rightwing Jews are weaponizing it, Kenneth Stern;

https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/dec/13/antisemitismexecutive-order-trump-chilling-effect

- 10.Jewish Voice for Peace opposes IHRA definition of antisemitism; <u>https://jewishvoiceforpeace.org/ihra/</u>
- 11.Jewish Voice for Peace POSTS TAGGED "STATE DEPARTMENT DEFINITION OF ANTI-SEMITISM"; <u>https://jewishvoiceforpeace.org/topics/state-</u> <u>department-definition-of-anti-semitism/</u>
- 12.Jewish Voice for Peace Search Results for "antisemitism definition"; <u>https://jewishvoiceforpeace.org/?s=antisemitism+definition</u>
- 13. Everything you need to know about human rights in Israel and Occupied Palestinian Territories – Amnesty International; <u>https://www.amnesty.org/en/countries/middle-east-and-north-africa/israel-and-occupied-palestinian-territories/report-israel-and-occupied-palestinian-territories/</u>
- 14. The IHRA definition of anti-Semitism and why people are fighting over it, explained, BY BEN SALES; <u>https://www.jta.org/2021/01/15/global/the-ihra-</u> <u>definition-of-anti-semitism-and-why-people-are-fighting-over-it-explained</u>
- 15.Students and the Middle East Conflict The New York Times; <u>https://www.nytimes.com/2016/08/07/education/edlife/middle-east-</u> <u>conflict-on-campus-anti-semitism.html</u>; or <u>https://www.deanza.edu/dasg/agendasminutes/2020-2021/2021-04-21-</u> <u>attachments/Students-and-the-Middle-East-Conflict-The-New-York-</u> <u>Times.pdf</u>
- 16.Criticizing Israel is not antisemitic it's academic freedom The Conversaion; <u>https://theconversation.com/criticizing-israel-is-not-antisemitic-its-academic-freedom-148864</u>
- 17.The IHRA definition will not help fight anti-Semitism Al Jazeera; <u>https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2020/11/23/the-ihra-and-the-palestinian-struggle-for</u>
- 18.Palestine Legal; <u>https://palestinelegal.org/</u>
- 19.Backgrounder on Redefinition Palestine Legal; <u>https://palestinelegal.org/redefinition-efforts?rq=IHRA</u>
- 20.Palestine Legal Legislation; <u>https://legislation.palestinelegal.org/</u>
- 21.Joint Statement on Vigil With Jewish Voice for Peace at Berkeley Facebook; <u>https://www.facebook.com/notes/778340502735722/</u>
- 22.Pro-Israel Students File Complaint to Department of Education About SJP Vigil at Berkeley; <u>https://jewishjournal.com/news/united-</u>

states/241882/pro-israel-students-file-complaint-department-educationsip-vigil-berkeley/

- 23.Trump administration adopts new definition of anti-Semitism in schools; Critics worry the move will stifle free speech on campus. – POLITICO; <u>https://www.politico.eu/article/donald-trump-administration-adopts-new-definition-of-anti-semitism-in-schools-education-department/</u>
- 24.In a first, De Anza College passes divestment motion in support of Palestinian rights – SJP WEST; <u>https://sipwest.org/2017/03/22/in-a-first-de-anza-college-passes-divestment-motion-in-support-of-palestinian-rights/</u>
- 25.Quick Facts: The IHRA Working Definition of Anti-Semitism | IMEU; <u>https://imeu.org/article/4903</u>
- 26.Quick Facts: The Palestinian Nakba | IMEU; <u>https://imeu.org/article/quick-facts-the-palestinian-nakba</u>
- 27.Palestine 101 | IMEU; <u>https://imeu.org/topic/category/palestine-101</u>
- 28.Anti-Palestinian Racism Is Behind IHRA's Antisemitism Definition; <u>https://readpassage.com/anti-palestinian-racism-is-behind-ihras-antisemitism-definition/</u>
- 29. The IHRA Definition of Antisemitism: Defining Antisemitism by Erasing Palestinians; <u>https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.1111/1467-923X.12883</u>
- 30.Department of Fair Employment and Housing (DFEH); <u>https://www.dfeh.ca.gov/</u>
- 31.U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission; https://www.eeoc.gov/
- 32.U.S. Department of Education Office for Civil Rights; <u>https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/index.html</u>
- 33.DASB Senate passes resolution to divest from Israeli occupations La Voz News; <u>https://lavozdeanza.com/story-carousel/news/2017/03/21/dasb-senate-passes-israel-divestment-resolution/</u>
- 34.California community college first to pass Israel divestment resolution | The Electronic Intifada; <u>https://electronicintifada.net/blogs/nora-barrows-friedman/california-community-college-first-pass-israel-divestment-resolution</u>
- 35.California community college students adopt universal definition of anti-Semitism; <u>https://www.jns.org/california-community-college-students-</u> adopt-universal-definition-of-anti-semitism/

- 36.California Community College Students Adopt Universal Definition of Antisemitism | Jewish & Israel News Algemeiner.com; <u>https://www.algemeiner.com/2020/10/25/california-community-college-</u> <u>students-adopt-universal-definition-of-antisemitism/</u>
- 37.Calling Campuses to Adopt IHRA's Definition of Antisemitism | Ilan Sinelnikov | The Blogs; <u>https://blogs.timesofisrael.com/calling-campuses-</u> <u>to-adopt-ihras-definition-of-antisemitism/</u>
- 38.De Anza IHRA Resources Google Docs; <u>https://docs.google.com/document/d/1amb3sRtuY6PdpBvylvZvg2hEEqFSN</u> <u>GGNoaQZCFrhwQ0/edit</u>
- 39.GAZA: A GAPING WOUND; https://obliteratedfamilies.com/en/gaza/
- 40.Checkpoint Jasiri X YouTube; <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Dq6Y6LSjulU&ab_channel=jasirix</u>
- الشهيد الطفل مأمون الخطيب16 عاما ضحية جديد تضاف الى عمليات التصفية الميدانية.41 (The aftermath of killing a 15 year old Palestinian boy on his walk home from school) – YouTube;

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wqo6kul4HdA&ab_channel=nativitytv

- 42. الاحتلال يغلق جامعة العروب بقرار عسكري حتى اشعار اخر occupied Palestine) – YouTube; <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o5lKpd33qUo&ab_channel=Mohamm</u> adHalayka
- 43. مواجهات في مخيم العروب شمال الخليل living under the military occupation of Israel.) – YouTube; <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?t=107&v=RmMgvAGTLWA&feature=you</u> <u>tu.be&ab_channel=WafaAgency</u>
- 44.Israel Is Demonstrating Medical Apartheid, Not Vaccine Leadership The Wire Science; <u>https://science.thewire.in/health/israel-is-demonstrating-medical-apartheid-not-vaccine-leadership/</u>

Section B -

Documents Submitted to the DASG Senate and/or Office of College Life

- 1. A Resolution Acknowledging, Defining, and Condemning Antisemitism; <u>https://www.deanza.edu/dasg/agendasminutes/2020-2021/2021-04-21-attachments/IHRA-Language-Student-Gov-De-Anza.pdf</u>
- 2. Questions and Answers on Executive Order 13899 (Combating Anti-Semitism) and OCR's Enforcement of Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964; <u>https://www.deanza.edu/dasg/agendasminutes/2020-2021/2021-04-21-</u> <u>attachments/qa-titleix-anti-semitism-20210119.pdf</u>
- De Anza Associated Student Body (DASB) Government Resolution In Support of Divestment from Companies That Profit from the Israeli Occupation of Palestinian Territories;

https://www.deanza.edu/dasg/agendasminutes/2020-2021/2021-04-21attachments/Resolution-for-Divestment-from-Companies-That-Profit-from-Israeli-Occupation-of-Palestine.pdf From: Esha Dadbhawala

Sent: Wednesday, February 24, 2021

Subject: IHRA Resources

Hello everybody,

I'm sure we can all remember Sara's account of the trauma she experienced while visiting her family in Palestine. She has graciously volunteered to collate resources on IHRA, linked in this email, which includes a definition of antisemitism provided by the Jewish Voice for Peace. I have copy-pasted the definition below, and I urge Senate to vote no on adopting the IHRA definition in favor of either the JVP definition or a definition created by LAC. I have also CC'd Cynthia, as I think we can all agree that her testimony was invaluable at today's meeting.

IHRA Resources

[https://docs.google.com/document/d/1amb3sRtuY6PdpBvylvZvg2hEEqFSNGGNo aQZCFrhwQ0/edit]

JVP definition of antisemitism and statement on the IHRA: Antisemitism is part of the machinery of division and fear politicians and pundits use to hold onto or expand their power — the same machinery that is used to target people of color, Muslims, Palestinians, and other minority communities. At a time when the dangers of white nationalism, including racism, antisemitism and Islamophobia, are all too apparent, the need to build safety for all people has never been greater. However, the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance's (IHRA) controversial working definition of antisemitism is fundamentally not the answer. The IHRA definition was originally drafted as a possible way for European governmental bodies to monitor antisemitism in Europe; as one of its authors points out, it was <u>never intended for use in policy or legislation</u> [https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/dec/13/antisemitism-executive-order-trump-chilling-effect].

Best,

Esha Dadbhawala, She/They

From: Sarita Bronstein

Sent: Friday, February 26, 2021

Subject: RE: IHRA Resources

Dear all,

I apologize for not responding sooner; I have been out most of yesterday and today.

Thanks for including me in this conversation. I appreciate Dennis bringing up The Brown Act. The Brown Act aims to prevent Senators from making decisions together behind closed doors prior to a vote by communicating with each other outside the meeting. However, it does not preclude the senators from speaking with relevant parties to gain knowledge about an issue being brought up for a vote. Therefore, I concur with Hyon Chu that greater understanding is critical in helping you to make an informed decision; I appreciate the opportunity to talk with any of the Senators who wish to learn about the topic.

It was brought up to my attention by parents of students who attended the meeting on Wednesday and who happen to be attorneys that the IHRA definition is being used as the definition against which educational institutions are evaluated by the federal government when investigating claims of discriminatory conduct. This means that any university or college receiving Federal funds has de facto agreed to adopt the IHRA definition. It is also the definition that schools are required to proactively consider when formulating policies to create a safe environment on campus under Title VI. I was unsure if the Senators were aware of this information and thought it is relevant as you consider your position.

I want to introduce additional reading sources:

https://blogs.timesofisrael.com/ihra-definition-of-antisemitism-can-fosterhealthy-dialogues/

https://www.insidehighered.com/views/2021/02/02/anti-semitism-majorproblem-campuses-and-students-must-be-educated-about-it-opinion

https://www.jpost.com/opinion/combatting-antisemitism-why-the-world-needsto-adopt-the-ihra-definition-645275

https://thehill.com/blogs/congress-blog/politics/315195-freedom-of-speech-andthe-anti-semitism-awareness-act-on-college

Many thanks for what you do as student leaders!

Sarita

Sarita Bronstein

Executive Director

Hillel of Silicon Valley

From: Hyon Chu Yi-Baker

Date: Monday, March 1, 2021

Subject: Fw: IHRA Resources

Hi Pat and Alicia. I wanted to bring this issue to your attention and also get your comments regarding the email [from Sarita Bronstein on February 26, 2021]. This was sent to us by the Executive Director of Hillel of Silicon Valley, Sarita Bronstein. At our last DASB Senate meeting, there was a presentation on endorsing a resolution to adopt an Anti-Semitic definition for our campus. The presentation was given by a few De Anza students who identify as Jewish and apparently FH student government recently voted to approve this resolution.

We had some guests at our Senate meeting that fiercely opposed this resolution as they believe it has connections to the Israeli government. I'm sure both of you aware of the complex and sensitive issue of the Israeli and Palestinian conflict. My question is what are your thoughts about this resolution even coming to our Senate, let alone if they approve it? I know DASB does not have the authority to enforce this definition and really their only influence is to show their support. I'm meeting with my executive Senators later today and I want to give them as much information regarding how this resolution would be perceived and used on our campus if they should vote in favor of it.

Also, Pat, can you direct me to any District policy on unlawful harassment and any language regarding anti-Semitism.

Thank you both for your time and assistance.

Best,

Dr. Hyon Chu Yi-Baker, Ed.D (she/her)

Faculty Director of College Life & Judicial Affairs Officer

DeAnza College

From: Pat Hyland

Sent: Monday, March 1, 2021

Subject: Re: IHRA Resources

Hello All!

I think the attached document

[https://www.deanza.edu/dasg/agendasminutes/2020-2021/2021-04-21attachments/qa-titleix-anti-semitism-20210119.pdf] gives a great summary of how anti-Semitism is addressed in Title VI and how OCR enforces it. Marinate on it a bit and we can chat.

Let me know if you need more.

Pat

Pat Hyland

Interim Director, Human Resources, Equity, Employment & Professional Development

Foothill – DeAnza CCD

From: Hyon Chu Yi-Baker

Sent: Monday, March 1, 2021

Subject: Re: IHRA Resources

Thanks Pat. I've never seen this document, so that was helpful. So if I'm reading this correctly based on their statement, "This document is intended only to provide clarity to the public regarding existing requirements under the law", it sounds like there is nothing new in terms of any legal recourse or new policy related to anti Semitism.

How does this translate to our college? What does it really mean for us?

Best,

Dr. Hyon Chu Yi-Baker, Ed.D (she/her)

Faculty Director of College Life & Judicial Affairs Officer

DeAnza College

From: Pat Hyland

Sent: Tuesday, March 2, 2021

Subject: Re: IHRA Resources

As a college district we have not adopted specific language related to anti-Semitism. Our policies and procedures cover general federal and California specific definitions of Protected Categories. Should the Board, Academic Senate, or other groups such as DASB choose to develop and adopt a resolution stating a position on something they feel impacts their members, they are free to do so as long as the resultant resolution is in accordance with the mission and vision of the organization. If DASB feels that, to bring focus to or guidance around an issue that is impacting members that is not addressed through existing policy, procedure or philosophy, it may be advantageous to draft a resolution addressing the concern. Our students, faculty, staff and even community members are "protected" against unlawful discrimination based on their status as a member of, or association with a member of a protected category. That said, the key word is "unlawful" – it is not unlawful to call someone a jerk, nor is it unlawful for someone to say they don't like members of a protected category. Only when it can be shown that the harassment is "sufficiently severe, persistent, pervasive or objectively offensive, so as to create a hostile or abusive educational or working environment or to limit the individual's ability to participate in or benefit from an education program or activity" does it become actionable.

A good resource for the concept of resolutions is found in the Academic Senate Resolution Handbook. One relevant paragraph follows.

RESOLUTIONS: BORNE OUT OF ISSUES It is the job of the Academic Senate Executive Committee, along with its standing and ad hoc committees, to research underlying issues and problems related to academic and professional matters. The initial goal is to understand the issue, concern, or problem as completely as possible. After an issue has been considered, investigated, and discussed thoroughly, the Executive Committee makes every effort to educate the body about the issue through mechanisms such as plenary breakout sessions, Rostrum articles, regional 4 meetings, webinars, and/or adopted papers. In many instances, before the Academic Senate can take action on an issue, concern, or problem the adoption of a resolution is necessary by the body to provide direction. In these situations, it is the Executive Committee's responsibility to make sure that the body has accurate information and thoughtful arguments about emerging issues in order to promote a deeper understanding of the pros and cons of an issue. Plenary session attendees then debate the resolutions at the pro and con microphones and ultimately take a position on the issues. The Executive Committee acknowledges that education about an issue goes both ways and strives to be open to new information and arguments at all stages of the resolution development, debate, and adoption process.

The primary sources that inform our policies and procedures are:

https://www.dfeh.ca.gov/

https://www.eeoc.gov/

https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/index.html

This should give you a start.

Pat Hyland

Interim Director, Human Resources, Equity, Employment & Professional Development

Foothill – DeAnza CCD

From: Gai Blaunstein

Sent: Sunday, February 28, 2021

From: Adam Ashkenazy

Sent: Monday, March 1, 2021

Subject: IHRA Definition of Antisemitism at De Anza College

Dear Senator,

My name is Gai Blausntein/Adam Ashkenazy, and I am writing to you today as a Jewish student in support of passing the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) Definition of Antisemitism at De Anza College.

I want to thank you for your time on Wednesday night. I genuinely appreciate you listening to our concerns and hearing why passing the internationally-recognized definition of antisemitism is crucial to Jewish students at De Anza College, students like me.

The IHRA Definition is an educational tool and serves as a guide for universities and colleges to identify, educate, and address all forms of antisemitism that students like me experience. No marginalized group in the world should be deprived of defining what hate against them is. We should never tell members of the LGBTQ+ community what homophobia is or tell Muslims, who are also the victims of hate in the U.S., what Islamophobia is. Or define racism for the black community. So why should Jews not be able to define antisemitism? We are asking you to adopt this definition that has been embraced by the majority of the global Jewish community.

I was disappointed that several individuals took the opportunity to spread misinformation about the IHRA Definition of Antisemitism to redirect the focus of the discussion during Wednesday's meeting. The fact is that the IHRA definition is an educational tool intended to protect the Jewish community on campus. In 2016, 31 countries adopted this definition of antisemitism, including the U.S. Department of State under the Obama administration and the Biden administration. Even The Global Council of Imams (GIC), which are leaders in the Islamic world, support and have adopted IHRA.

At the meeting on Wednesday, some individuals claimed that the IHRA Definition of Antisemitism stifles free speech, in particular criticism of Israel. There is no evidence that this is the case anywhere where the IHRA definition has been adopted. The IHRA Definition of antisemitism explicitly states that criticism of Israel is NOT antisemitism. "Criticism of Israel similar to that leveled against any other country cannot be regarded as anti-Semitic"

(<u>https://www.state.gov/defining-anti-semitism/</u>). To cite an example of this, President Obama adopted the IHRA Definition of antisemitism; he was a fierce critic of Israel even after adopting IHRA.

According to the FBI's hate crimes <u>statistics</u> [https://ucr.fbi.gov/hate-crime/2019], the Jewish community -- which comprises just 2% of the U.S. population -- accounts for 57% of the victims of crimes based on religious bias. According to this <u>report [https://data-openjustice.doj.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2020-06/Hate%20Crime%20In%20CA%202019.pdf]</u>, in California alone, antisemitic hate crimes rose nearly 12% in 2019, including a fatal shooting at a Southern California synagogue, even as hate crimes overall declined statewide by 4.8%. As antisemitism surges to inordinate levels in California, the United States, and worldwide, discrimination must be defined to eradicate it.

Many of us at De Anza College come from all different backgrounds. Many of us have experienced discrimination firsthand or are descendants of generations of people who have been persecuted, oppressed, and annihilated for their religion, ethnicity, or race. Your vote will signal your support for the Jewish students on campus and send the message that, along with other hateful forms of prejudice and discrimination, you will not stand for antisemitism at De Anza College. Adopting the IHRA definition of Antisemitism will help Jewish students feel safe and welcome on campus.

Please stand with my peers and me and affirm that we have a place at De Anza College and that you understand our fears and concerns. Rejecting the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance Definition of Antisemitism would signal that we are not valued with the same regard as other communities on campus who experience discrimination and prejudice.

Please reach out if you would like to learn more about this critical issue for the Jewish students at De Anza College.

Thank you

Gai/Adam

From: Sabreen Imtair

Sent: Tuesday, March 2, 2021

Subject: Please Vote No on IHRA: Protect Students Right to Free Speech and Stand Against Oppression

Hello De Anza Student Senators,

My name is Sabreen, I'm a 3rd-year student at SFSU majoring in Political Science with a minor in Arab and Muslim Ethnicities and Diaspora Studies. I'm the president of the General Union of Palestine Students (GUPS) at SFSU, an organization dedicated to raising awareness on the struggle for justice in/for Palestine. Although I'm not a De Anza student, I attended last week's meeting out of concern when I heard that the IHRA definition of antisemitism was being proposed at De Anza. I know of many Palestinian students and those who stand in solidarity who attend De Anza who if this legislation would pass through affirmations from their elected student representatives would hurt and feel isolated on campus. I will break down why I'm opposed to IHRA from my perspective as a Palestinian woman, a student organizer at SFSU, and a community organizer in the Bay Area. I will also address talking points brought up during last week's meeting in support of IHRA and break down why they are either outright lies or misleading. I also hope my email is as short, clear, and straight to the point as possible. Many Americans don't hear from the perspective of Palestinians ever, I hope my perspective which is grounded in facts, history, and first-hand experience is valued and respected.

I also will not bore you with a history lesson on Palestine. Although, I believe it is necessary for all to know at least basic facts about the colonization of Palestine it is not necessary to be an expert in Palestinian history to stand up for human rights and dignity. Expertise and nuance aren't required to support any group resisting oppression. I will link resources below that explain some history and context if you wish to learn more.

- I will first address the claim that IHRA is about tackling antisemitism Anti-Semitism is a problem, the rise of fringe right-wing and white supremacist groups who have been pulled into the mainstream by Trump and have been emboldened by his presidency show us that. Yet, IHRA doesn't tackle antisemitism and wasn't even meant to be used as legislation and policy, Kenneth Stern chief author of the definition has said this [https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/dec/13/antisemitism] -executive-order-trump-chilling-effect]. IHRA instead is less about addressing antisemitism, but more about conflating anti-Zionism and even just simple criticism of Israel with antisemitism. This to discourage such speech and activism, and to as far as criminalizing speech that is critical of Israel. In fact, seven out of the eleven examples of antisemitism listed in the definition aim to shield Israel from criticism and accountability. Last week I saw proponents of IHRA falsely claim IHRA has nothing to do with Israel and doesn't even mention Israel. That is easily disproved by what the State Government [sic] says about IHRA and the examples of violating IHRA [https://www.state.gov/defining-anti-semitism/].
- This leads to my second point I will make. This conflation of antisemitism with anti-Zionism and criticism of Israel does a couple of things. It violates our freedom of speech and completely erases Palestinians. Here are some examples:

- How does it violate our freedom of speech? Well first, don't we all have the right to criticize any nation-state for its violations of human rights? Why is Israel protected from such criticisms? Are Palestinian human rights the exception to our responsibility to uphold human rights and justice? Israel has been protected for decades from being held accountable by International law and within the United Nations. IHRA has been used as a censorship tool to silence Palestinians, pro-Palestine activists, and academics. Nowhere do we see this more evident than in academic institutions. College campuses have been hotspots for censoring Israel critical speech. There are tons of money being spent, pressure on student governments and university administrations, and legislation being passed to push back against the rise of pro-Palestine justice advocacy and academia.
- Even though the IHRA claims it doesn't want to censor Israel critical speech, the adoption of it has led to censorship and criminalization of such speech and advocates. The impact of IHRA has proven to be dangerous.
- In the United States, when former President Donald Trump passed IHRA through an executive order in 2019, it resulted immediately in three claims being filed with the Department of Education that targeted Palestine advocacy on college campuses [https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.1111/1467-923X.12883]. In the Bay Area, at UC Berkeley, we've seen IHRA's impact. <u>Here is what happened at UC Berkeley</u> [https://palestinelegal.org/redefinition-efforts?rq=IHRA], from Palestine Legal. An organization dedicated to protecting and providing legal expertise to pro-Palestine student organizers, faculty, and staff on college campuses. "A November 2018 vigil [https://www.facebook.com/notes/778340502735722/] organized by Jewish students at UC Berkeley to jointly mourn the deaths of Palestinian children killed in Gaza and Jewish people killed in the Pittsburgh massacre became the subject [https://jewishjournal.com/news/united-states/241882/pro-israelstudents-file-complaint-department-education-sip-vigil-berkeley/] of a Title VI complaint to the U.S. Department of Education Office for

Civil Rights (OCR). Attorneys who filed the complaint alleged that the vigil was to portray 'Israel as a barbarian and racist nation,' falling under the IHRA definition being applied by Trump's OCR, and said the students who organized the vigil should be expelled. Instead of the planned public event, students held a small private vigil due to the threats and intimidation"

- This is a direct excerpt from the scholarly article, "The IHRA Definition of Antisemitism: Defining Antisemitism by Erasing Palestinians" by Rebecca Ruth Gould who writes on the impacts of IHRA in the UK and Europe. "a charity event in aid of Palestinian children was cancelled owing to a London council's fear of breaching the IHRA definition guidelines. Universities have been particularly affected: an Israel-critical event pertaining to Boycott, Divestment, Sanctions (BDS) was cancelled at the University of Central Lancashire; at the University of Exeter, students were banned from staging a street theatre performance during Israel Apartheid Week in 2017; at the University of Manchester, the title of a talk was changed so as to avoid criticism of Israel". These are just a few out of the many examples.
- Now, I will address my claim that the IHRA definition silences and erases Palestinians. I will use the very examples listed in the IHRA definition, and their implications in erasing Palestinians. The most controversial example and that has been written about a lot is," Denying the Jewish people their right to self-determination, e.g., by claiming that the existence of a State of Israel is a racist endeavor". Israel is a settler-colonial state founded on the ideology of Zionism. Zionism, whose founders and supporters propped as a colonial movement, referred to Israel as a colony and implemented plans to wipe out and cleanse Palestinians from their indigenous homeland. Modern-day Israel would not exist if it wasn't for the mass ethnic cleansing and massacre plans lead by Zionist leaders and paramilitaries. These plans are known as Plan Dalet lead to over 700,000 Palestinians being expelled out of their homes and made refugees and the destruction and cleansing of over 500 towns. Today, you will find an occupation of Palestine, Gazans living in the

biggest open-air prison, Palestinians being imprisoned with no fair judicial processes, living under medical apartheid as evidenced by Israel not giving COVID vaccines to Palestinians and supplying the Palestinian healthcare sector with adequate medical and sanitizing supplies, millions of Palestinian refugees denied their right to go back home, the list goes on. The colonization of Palestine is a racist endeavor and Palestinians being pressured by legislation to censor their history and experiences of oppression, only results in the erasure of our experiences. The silencing of Palestinians is anti-Arab and anti-Palestinian racism. Should we be silent and even as far as complicit in this erasure and ethnic cleansing? As South African, antiapartheid Bishop Desmond Tutu says, "if you are neutral in situations of injustice, you have chosen the side of the oppressor".

 Another side to this censorship and repression is seen in the Zionist and imperialist blacklisting sites that target pro-Palestinian students and faculty for their advocacy. One prominent website that many students have heard of/have experience with is Canary Mission. Canary Mission is a racist, Islamophobic, and Zionist website dedicated to doxxing activists and academics. Canary Mission has dozens of profiles blacklisting students for their opposition to IHRA. Everybody has the right to oppose IHRA, and should not be policed and blacklisted for such.

Lastly, I want all senators to consider the effect voting yes on this resolution would have. I want to clarify the legal implications and history of IHRA legislation first. Although a claim has been made that Obama adopted IHRA first, that is not the case. Obama was president in 2016 when IHRA as an organization, and the United States as a member state, adopted their current working definition. However, it was President Trump, with Betsy DeVos's support, that passed the executive order that required all schools receiving federal funding use the IHRA definition of antisemitism. This legislation passed in the Republican-led Senate, but not in the Democrat-led House, as some Democrats cited concerns over stifling free speech on campuses. [https://www.politico.eu/article/donald-trumpadministration-adopts-new-definition-of-anti-semitism-in-schools-educationdepartment/] The legal support for this resolution is an executive order from one man, a former president, an executive order that could be turned over at any time. However, even if it is not turned over, I would urge the Senate to not make decisions based on the federal government's position on certain issues. After all, the United States government financially aids many oppressive nation-states as well as implementing oppressive policy on a domestic level. We've seen this just recently with the Trump administration, the national government doesn't represent our interests. In terms of your power as a Senate, I want to urge you not to vote in favor of this resolution to demonstrate support for free speech on college campuses. Your vote will serve as a precedent for other college campuses that are currently or will eventually vote on the same resolution and will indicate to higher-level governments such as the Board of Trustees and SSCCC how students feel about this issue. Moreover, I would urge the Senate to continue your legacy of setting an excellent example of institutional support in support of justice and rights despite backlash, on this international conflict by voting against the IHRA resolution. [https://sjpwest.org/2017/03/22/in-a-first-de-anza-collegepasses-divestment-motion-in-support-of-palestinian-rights/]

I want to end with a quote from the prominent scholar and revolutionary, Angela Davis. "When we are engaged in the struggle against racial violence... we can't forget the connections with Palestine. In many ways, we have to engage in an exercise of intersectionality. Of always foregrounding those connections so that people remember nothing happens in isolation". If we are all indeed united in the fight against racism and fighting for the self-determination of all peoples. Palestinians are no expectation. I urge you to take a stance with IHRA and say no to passing it. I know this is hard, especially in the face of so much opposition, and I want to say I understand so much. It is hard when being targeted by students, outside organizations, and threatened with blacklisting. These repressive efforts don't work when we all unite to say these practices and racist legislations don't represent us not at the national level, and for sure not on our own college campuses.

Thank you for your time and patience. Please feel free to email me if you have any questions.

In community,

Sabreen

Resources:

- Defining Anti-Semitism United States Department of State; <u>https://www.state.gov/defining-anti-semitism/</u>
- The IHRA definition will not help fight anti-Semitism; <u>https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2020/11/23/the-ihra-and-the-palestinian-struggle-for</u>
- Criticizing Israel is not antisemitic it's academic freedom; <u>https://theconversation.com/criticizing-israel-is-not-antisemitic-its-academic-freedom-148864</u>
- Tag: State Department Definition of Anti-Semitism; <u>https://jewishvoiceforpeace.org/topics/state-department-definition-of-anti-semitism/</u>
- The IHRA Definition of Antisemitism: Defining Antisemitism by Erasing Palestinians; <u>https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.1111/1467-</u> 923X.12883
- Jewish Voice for Peace opposes IHRA definition of antisemitism; <u>https://jewishvoiceforpeace.org/ihra/</u>
- Quick Facts: The IHRA Working Definition of Anti-Semitism; <u>https://imeu.org/article/4903</u>
- I drafted the definition of antisemitism. Rightwing Jews are weaponizing it | Kenneth Stern; <u>https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/dec/13/antisemitism-</u>

executive-order-trump-chilling-effect

- Palestine Legal; <u>https://palestinelegal.org/</u>
- Backgrounder on Redefinition Palestine Legal; <u>https://palestinelegal.org/redefinition-efforts?rq=IHRA</u>
- Palestine Legal Legislation; <u>https://legislation.palestinelegal.org/</u>
- Anti-Palestinian Racism Is Behind IHRA's Antisemitism Definition; <u>https://readpassage.com/anti-palestinian-racism-is-behind-ihras-antisemitism-definition/</u>
- Quick Facts: The Palestinian Nakba | IMEU; <u>https://imeu.org/article/quick-facts-the-palestinian-nakba</u>
- Palestine 101 | IMEU; <u>https://imeu.org/topic/category/palestine-101</u>

From: Ori Nirpaz

Subject: The adoption of IHRA's definition of anti-semitism

Date: March 2, 2021

Dear senator,

My name is Ori and I am a senator at ASFC. As a Jewish student at your sister school, I believe that it is of utmost importance to pass the internationally recognized definition of antisemitism at your campus this Wednesday. It should be stated that the Foothill College student board voted unanimously to pass the resolution in our school, as it protects Jewish students and recognizes our human rights. It has been stated by the opposition that students and administrators will be silenced; that they won't be able to be critical of Israel if this definition is adopted. However, there is no proof that this will happen, it has NOT happened at Foothill College, or any of the other 30 schools where this definition has been adopted. There is evidence, however, that when there is not a clear definition of anti-semitism, hate crimes towards the Jewish community rise.

There is not a single line in this resolution that calls for censorship. Voting yes simply means that you support making a statement against antisemitism, and increasing education and diversity training in order to combat antisemitism in the future.

Given that De Anza College accepts federal funding, the school already adheres to the IHRA definition of anti-semitism under Title VI, and yet no faculty or student has experienced their freedom of speech being stifled. They have continued to express harsh criticism of Israel.

I hope that you make the right decision and stand for social justice and human rights when faced against hatred and bigotry, by passing the IHRA definition of anti-semitism at your school as well.

Thank you,

Ori

From: Adam Ashkenazy

Sent: Wednesday, March 3, 2021

Subject: Letter from 71st Secretary of State

Dear Senators,

I would like to share with you a recent letter from the 71st Secretary of State that shows the Democratic administration adopting this definition of antisemitism. Attached, please find. Richard D. Heideman President of American Zionist Movement 40 Wall Street, Suite 706 New York, NY 10005

Dear Mr. Heideman:

Thank you for your heartfelt letter on my confirmation as Secretary of State. During my tenure as Secretary, I look forward to working with the American Zionist Movement and other organizations committed to Israel's security and to strengthening all aspects of the U.S.-Israel partnership, Holocaust remembrance, and countering anti-Semitism here at home and around the world.

The United States and Israel are bound by historic and cultural ties as well as our shared commitment to democracy, free trade, national security, and cultural exchange. The United States will continue to be a strong partner in fighting efforts to delegitimize Israel, and we will work equally tirelessly to counter attempts to isolate Israel in the international community as we also work to advance a two-state solution where a Jewish and democratic Israel can live side by side in peace, prosperity, security, and freedom with a viable Palestinian state.

As the stepson of a Holocaust survivor, I wholeheartedly believe that we must remain vigilant in speaking out against bigotry, intolerance, and those who seek to undermine democracy. The Biden Administration enthusiastically embraces the 2016 International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance's Working Definition of Anti-Semitism, including its examples. We are eager to work with allies and partners to counter Holocaust distortion and combat anti-Semitism and other forms of intolerance abroad while we strengthen our efforts at home, including redoubling our efforts to counter violent extremism.

Sincerely,

Antony J. Blinken

Best,

Adam